



# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN SOCIAL SCIENCES & HUMANITIES

An International Open-Access Peer Reviewed Refereed Journal

Impact Factor: 6.064

E-ISSN : 2249 – 4642

P-ISSN: 2454 - 4671

## EMPLOYING CRITICISM APPROACHES IN TEACHING THE TRANSLATION OF SHORT STORIES

**Whaj Muneer Esmail**

Al-Ma'moom University College, Iraq

DOI: <http://doi.org/10.37648/ijrssh.v12i02.041>

**Paper Received:**

03<sup>rd</sup> May 2022

**Paper Accepted:**

12<sup>th</sup> June 2022

**Paper Received After Correction:**

26<sup>th</sup> June 2022

**Paper Published:**

29<sup>th</sup> June 2022



**How to cite the article:** Esmail W.M.(2022). Employing Criticism Approaches in Teaching the Translation of Short Stories, *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences & Humanities*, April-June 2022 Vol. 12, Issue 2; 628-634 DOI: <http://doi.org/10.37648/ijrssh.v12i02.041>

**ABSTRACT**

Criticism plays a pivotal role through the pros and cons of translation levels, and this outstandingly can be achieved via applying critical analysis for the translated texts. This can be regarded as examples boosting students' knowledge in translation activities. This paper tries to explore approaches of translation criticism and their applications in teaching translation to students of translation departments. Thus, a translation of a short story has been taken into account as a key tool for applying a critical analysis.

The study focuses on analyzing the story of Hamid Al-Rubaie (A woman of water) and its translation by the translator Abdul-Sahib Al-Butaihi, and demonstrating its translational and stylistic lapses, if any, as well as showing its positive aspects, which makes this critical study an analytical approach to develop students' ability to translate short stories.

**Keywords:** *Translation, Criticism Approaches, Short Stories*

يلعب النقد دورًا محوريًا بأعماده على إيجابيات وسلبيات مستويات الترجمة ، ويمكن تحقيق ذلك وبشكل جيد من خلال تطبيق التحليل النقدي للنصوص المترجمة والذي بدوره يعتبر كمثال يعزز من معرفة طلبة الترجمة في أنشطة الترجمة المختلفة. يهدف هذا البحث الى التاكيد عن مناهج نقد الترجمة وتطبيقاتها في تدريس الترجمة لطلاب أقسام الترجمة. وبالتالي ، تم أخذ ترجمة القصة القصيرة في الاعتبار كأداة رئيسية لتطبيق التحليل النقدي.

تركز الدراسة على تحليل قصة حامد الربيعي (امرأة من ماء) وترجمتها للمترجم عبد الصاحب البطيحي ، وبيان البعض من الهفوات الترجمية والأسلوبية إن وجدت ، بالإضافة الى التعرف على جوانبها الإيجابية ، مما يجعل هذه الدراسة النقدية منهجًا تحليليًا لتطوير قدرة الطلاب على ترجمة القصص القصيرة.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الترجمة، نقد الترجمة، القصص القصيرة

**INTRODUCTION**

The present paper tries to explore the effectiveness of the translation criticism approaches in teaching translation to students of translation departments. Teaching translation of literary texts always praised by many scholars due to their powerful impact on trainee translators. Another important element that contributes in one way or another to the selection of the literary texts by teachers

for the purpose of teaching translation is the way language used in literary texts, which is predominantly aesthetic and professional.

Translation departments are prepared for the purpose of teaching and training students through various types of translation and titles, including written translation and interpretation. These departments deal with teaching translation with all types of texts, including literary,

media, political, economic, sports, and others. This study includes samples of literary works; short stories, which were translated from Arabic into English by Iraqi translator.

These samples were subjected to translation criticism through various approaches, including linguistic and stylistic ones, to determine their effectiveness in analyzing the translated version of the chosen short story.

### **RELATED LITERATURE**

Translation criticism involves a complete commitment from the translator's side to every single detail of the ST (D'hulst, 1990). In this vein, the intention is not to deal with word-word translation, but to deal with the entire text as a piece of translation. In other words, critics focus on defining the translator's commitment to translate every word in the text and not to omit any of them except for reasons imposed by the nature of the language being translated into. Riess (1981) states that a text is the core of any piece of translation. In most cases, a translator should have a clear view regarding the text at hand. In addition, text type governs the method of translation, the fact that every translator should consider.

When dealing with translation as a process though the framework of theories of

meaning, it is said that translation is a process of editing the given text by extrapolating the meaning drawn by the components of this text that the author used to formulate a ST (Nord, 1991).

In other word, the translator's job is to reformulate the given text into a new one holds the intended meaning of the ST through applying different translation procedures. Translation criticism is one of the important methods pours just at the heart of translation pedagogy by giving the students certain instructions on how to criticize various texts. This has been confirmed by many translation scholars such as Juliana House Reiss and Anthony Pym.

Teaching translation by criticizing translated texts enhances the ability of the trainer and the learner to understand many concepts. For example, the learner is inspired by differentiating between the original text and the target text. This sort of inspiration gives him practical experience of a critical thinking through the criticism of the translated texts (Yuan et al., 2016).

One of the most important issue should widely be integrated in teaching translation is the Linguistic Equivalence. More apparently, equivalence is a very important technique one should look for through criticizing a piece of work. One of the

most important points that should be measured when criticizing translation is related to the linguistic equivalence. Possibly, this can be achieved through applying the equivalence approach to the TT that is being transferred from the translated text. The translator should not resort to rise to the level of the language of his translation or to deviate it, but rather he must adhere to the linguistic and stylistic level that the original text included. Therefore, it is not correct for the translator to translate a literary text containing traditional words into a literary text with contemporary terms. This in a way or another might damage the original meaning of what the writer wants to communicate in his piece of work.

*“Adequacy of translation refers to the procedure (process) of translation and thus it relates to the conditions of an interlingual and intercultural communicative act”* (Sharipova & Zhanzakova, 2018). This term is widely used to apply the criticism approaches to the translated versions. Translation adequacy is defined by Christopher (2001) as the process of transferring the ST in an ideal way to the TT with the same idealism that ST has.

It is concluded that teaching translation through the criticism of translated texts gives a wide area of perception and

cognitive experience to trainee translator. Moreover, the process of how to positively or negatively criticize certain text provides trainee translator with a clear knowledge and adequate experience of how translation is ought to be criticized.

It is also very important to determine the translation student's level of understanding the original text, by introducing him with a variety of intellectual perceptions that form different types of meanings. Furthermore, the translation student should be instructed to identify the perceptual skills, the correctness of his understanding the translated text, and the way the translator understands metaphors and other language devices.

The teacher's role should stick to introduce criticism, considering the translator's ability to find the meanings of words and levels of linguistic structures in the original text. As a result, the translation student finally analyzes the verbal, morphological, and moral significance of the word in the original text.

Another important issue translation trainer should notice is to instruct translation student to compare the terms of ST with the TT. The translation trainer has to examine the student's awareness of the semantic changes that may occur at the word level or sentence level because of historical or cultural factors.

Contextualization and reconceptualization are processes teachers of translation should be aware of through acquainting translation students with different techniques of how to deal with context. For instance, translators always resort to text in order to find the word meaning. Words have different meanings in different contexts. Therefore, translation teachers have to widely explain to their students how to find out words meaning through their relation to other words in a sentence or a text as a whole.

Style is another issue that should be regarded due to its sensitivity in translation. The Style is the way of writing introduced by the writer to express his/her ideas, beliefs, and so on. The style is one of the characteristics that describe the text therefore; translators have to realize it during the translation process.

Neutrality is another factor translation teachers have to be aware of since its strong relationship to the content of the text being involved in translation. This factor is a very important because it shapes the final draft of the translated text. No matter how the translator excels in the linguistic field and delivering the intended meaning, the translator's neutrality remains a key factor in conveying the meaning intended by the writer of the text.

To sum up, many factors play a pivotal role in shaping the TT in relation to the ST. These factors should be acknowledged and included in the curriculum of translation.

### APPROACHES TO TRANSLATION CRITICISM

For the purpose of employing translation criticism approaches, this study tackles the translated version of the short story “*A Woman Out of Water*”. One of these approaches is the *Translation Adequacy* that involves interlingual and intercultural communicative act.

Some samples of the translated version were chosen to be semantically and linguistically criticized in order to explain some views of how the criticism is done.

(أهل الرصافة، بعدما سمعوا بالضفادع النازلة من الفضاء، لم يصدقوا واعتبروا أهل الكرخ يببالغون في الوصف).

**“After Arrassafa people had got rumor of the descending frogs (fallen frogs) from heights ( , ) they showed rejection to accept such information and believed that it was a kind of exaggeration”.**

The translator precisely at this section delivered a version that is fully different from the original one. As shown in the translated version, the translator did not use the indefinite article (a) before

'rumor'. The description of "الضفادع" is translated into *descending frogs*, but it should be translated into 'fallen frogs' since the verb '*descend*' refers an action done by the frogs themselves whereas the frogs in the ST were forced to fall. The word "لم يصدقو" is translated into 'rejection', however; it ought to be translated into 'did not believe'. The translator resorted to omit Al-Karkh people from the ST. This is not possible at all, because the content of the story itself revolves entirely on the people of the people of Al-Karkh and Rusafa.

اضطر أهل الصويين الهروب من الشوارع واللجوء إلى ضفة النهر، تجمهروا هنالك يسألون عما يجري، خاصة أنهم لم يعهدوا في حياتهم أو كتب التاريخ أن حدثًا مماثلاً قد وقع في بغداد.

***"People of the Two Sides were obliged to escape from the streets and refuge to the river bank. They crowded there enquiring about what was going on for they had never met with such an extraordinary crisis before."***

This sentence illustrates another sample needs more explanation. The two words '*river bank*' should not be split otherwise meaning is affected that it would be better to be written as one word as 'riverbank'. Grammatically, the auxiliary '*was*' in 'what was going on' should be '*is*' because the time of the action refers to the present because the sentence describes an action at

the same moment of the utterance. The omission of the word "بغدا" demonstrates no sense because it is very important to be illustrated to the foreign readers that Al-Karkh and Russafa split Baghdad into two sides.

الجمهرة كانت في البداية للقليل والقال، لكنها، بعدما استأنست لعدم انهيار الجرف الطيني من شدة الزحام، تحولت لتبادل الأخبار، فلقد انقطعت الأنباء ما بين الصويين، منذ رحيل امرأة المطر.

***"At the beginning the mass were affected by gossip because information had been cut short since the departure of the rain woman. But later, after being certain that the crowd would never cause the mud bank to be collapsed they turned to exchange news."***

The translator used the plural form of the auxiliary verb (were) instead of (was) with the word '*mass*', though the singular form is supposed to be used. This is a linguistic issue ignored by the translator. A punctuation mark (,) is missed after the phrase "at the beginning" whereas this mark is an important sign used in English grammar. The translator deliberately introduced and delayed with order of the ST for an unclear reason, and the passage was supposed to be translated as written by the writer. Reformulating of the whole paragraph is recommended, because this proposed translation affects the meaning and leads to scatter the intention of the

writer. Table (0) shows some items that have been assessed in light of the adequacy approach.

**Table (0) Categorizing Translation Errors Based on Adequacy Approach**

Content	Form
Accuracy ST comparing to TT	Spelling
Terminology Suitability	Structure
Completeness meanings and concepts	Punctuation Marks
Flowing Readable & Understandable	Verb Agreement

## CONCLUSION

Through the aforementioned, it is seen that the translator did not intend to commit some mistakes, which were explained by some translated forms. However, the translator excelled in translating the short story. Therefore, it is possible to deduce the importance of applying the critical approach in enriching translation students with how to read translated texts and apply certain approaches for the pedagogical purposes. The adequacy approach was applied to the translated version of the short story (امرأة من ماء) revealing some mistakes committed by the translator. In addition, the translation criticism was reviewed in terms of its adequacy, represented by some items as mentioned in the above table.

This study recommends conducting more studies on translation criticism approaches in order to enhance translation students' abilities on how to deal with them in translation training sessions. Moreover, it is recommended to include some pedagogical implications of translation criticism in the training programs of the translation departments.

## REFERENCES

1. Alrubai, H. 2017. امرأة من ماء. Retrieved 10 Oct 2020, from <https://aljadeedmagazine.com>.
2. Christopher, R, (2001). Available at: <<https://www.amazon.com/Translation-Translating-Practice-Linguistics-Language/dp/1138135720>> [Accessed 22 October 2020].
3. D'hulst, L. (1990). Snell-Hornby, Mary. 1988. Translation Studies: An Integrated Approach. *Target. International Journal of Translation Studies*, 2(1), pp.128-133.
4. Hewson, L. (2011). *An Approach to Translation Criticism*. John Benjamins Publishing Company.
5. Nord, C. (1991). *Text analysis in translation: Theory, methodology and didactic application of a model for translation-oriented text analysis*.
6. Reiss, K. (1981). 'Type, Kind and Individuality of Text: Decision Making in Translation', *Poetics Today*, vol. 2, no. 4, p. 121.
7. Sharipova, M. and Zhanzakova, G., 2018. Translation as a Tool for Interlingual and Intercultural Communication. *Bulletin of L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University. Philology Series*, 124(3), pp.52-58.
8. Yuan, R., Sun, P., & Teng, L. (2016). Understanding language teachers' motivations towards research. *TESOL Quarterly*, 50(1), 220-234.